



Review English Learner Supports in Instructional Materials

Review English Learner Supports in Instructional Materials

California leads the country in articulating the importance of considering the needs of designated-English Learners when selecting materials. Our guidance is designed to help districts select effective programs to serve all students. Content area aside, districts should always ensure that their team has familiarity with the **English Language Development Framework** and the **types of ELD support** described by the California Department of Education. Using the English Language Development Framework in your adoption process can be good professional development for your teachers as well.

This resource will support a prescreening of materials for English Learner support. The information included here is drawn from the **English Language Development Framework**, **California County Superintendents Educational Services Association’s (CCSESA) ELA/ELD Toolkit**, **English Learner Success Forum guidance**, and **Sobrato Early Academic Language guidance**. We recommend the **CCSESA ELA/ELD Toolkit** for a more thorough and robust review process, including **biliteracy materials review**, once you’ve narrowed your materials down to a short list. We recommend English Learner Success Forum’s guides for ELA and Math materials review for content-specific guidance and for a more in-depth review of core **ELA** and **Math** materials.

How to Use this Rubric

Regardless of content area, all instructional materials should include the following key elements to effectively support ELs:

- research-based strategies embedded into materials design
- a focus on equitable access for all students
- compliance with state requirements

We know that no set of materials will include everything necessary to support English Learners and match your district’s specific needs. However, you can use the rubrics below to make important decisions about the frequency and depth of supports, which will jumpstart your adoption process.

We recommend using this rubric to prescreen all core instructional materials to narrow your options based on the presence of English Learners supports in alignment with the ELA/ELD Framework’s guidance for **integrated ELD**.

- The CA ELA/ELD Framework defines integrated ELD as an approach “in which all teachers with ELs in their classrooms use the CA ELD Standards in tandem with the CA Common Core State Standards (CCSS) or EL Literacy and other content standards.”
- It defines **designated ELD** as “a protected time during the regular school day in which teachers use the CA ELD standards as the focal standards in ways that build into and from content instruction in order to develop critical language ELs need for content learning in English.”

In general, integrated ELD (rubric sections 1-5) applies to all content areas while designated ELD (rubric section 6) applies only to ELA/ELD materials. For English Language Arts, we have included a section on designated ELD for Program 2 (Rubric 6).

Understanding California English Learner Programs

A note about district language acquisition programs versus instructional material programs: In California, districts provide, in accordance with the needs of their population, the following **programs**:

- 1. Structured English Immersion (SEI) Program:** A language acquisition program for English Learners in which nearly all classroom instruction is provided in English but with curriculum and a presentation designed for pupils who are learning English. At minimum, students are offered ELD and access to grade level academic subject matter content.
- 2. Dual-Language Immersion (DLI) Program:** Also referred to as Two-Way Immersion. A language acquisition program that provides language learning and academic instruction for native speakers of English and native speakers of another language, with the goals of high academic achievement, first and second language proficiency, and cross-cultural understanding. This program begins in Transitional Kindergarten/Kindergarten (TK/K) and continues to sixth grade.
- 3. Transitional Bilingual Program:** A language acquisition program for English Learners that provides instruction to pupils utilizing English and a pupil's native language for literacy and academic instruction, enabling an English learner to achieve English proficiency and meet state-adopted academic achievement goals. This program begins in TK/K and continues to third grade where students transition to instruction all in English.
- 4. Developmental Bilingual Program:** A language acquisition program for English Learners that provides instruction to pupils

utilizing English and a pupil's native language for literacy and academic instruction, enabling an English learner to achieve language proficiency and meet state academic achievement goals. This program begins in TK/K and continues, with the goal of biliteracy, to sixth grade.

- 5. Heritage Language Program:** A language acquisition program for English Learners that provides instruction to pupils utilizing English and a pupil's native language for literacy and academic instruction, enabling non-English speakers or students who have weak literacy skills in their native language to achieve language proficiency and meet academic achievement goals. This program is designed for grades 6-8 and 9-12.

Separately, ELA/ELD instructional materials fall into **one of five programs** when considered for the CA adoption list: Programs 1-3 are core instructional programs for ELA/ELD and Programs 4-5 are intervention programs for ELA/ELD. The programs are: **Program 1: Basic ELA, Program 2: Basic ELA/ELD, Program 3: Basic Biliteracy, Program 4: Intensive Intervention ELA, and Program 5: Specialized ELD. You can read descriptions of the programs in CCSESA's ELA/ELD Toolkit.**

Many thanks to Tina Cheuk, a doctoral candidate at the Graduate School of Education at Stanford, Renae Skarin of English Learner Success Forum, and Jennifer Diehl of Sobrato Early Academic Language for their support in reviewing these materials.

Prepare: Understanding your Context

Before reviewing materials, it's important to determine what your district's needs are in supporting English Learners. Use this section to define who your district serves to better identify what your materials will need to provide to support those students.

District Data					
Across your district, how many schools offer a:		Student Demographics		On the CA Dashboard, what percentage of students are:	
Structured English Immersion (SEI) Program?		Total number of students		At Level 1?	
Dual-Language Immersion (DLI) Program?		Total number of students who are ELs		At Level 2?	
Transitional Bilingual Program?		Percent that are ELs		At Level 3?	
Developmental Bilingual Program?		Percent that are newcomers		At Level 4?	
Heritage Language Program		Percent that are Long-Term English Learners (LTELs)		Note the required designated ELD minutes by proficiency and grade level:	
How many ELs are enrolled in total in these programs?		Percent reclassified annually			
		Is there a trend of increasing or decreasing EL enrollment?			

List your current ELD materials:

Prepare: Describing the instructional materials you will review

Based on the type of English Learner programs your district/school provides (as identified on page 3), select a curriculum to review for English Learner supports using this tool. Fill out the information below to describe the instructional materials you are reviewing and to identify which rubrics to use.

Title of curriculum you are reviewing: _____		
# schools that would use these materials		How do the material's assessments explicitly support the programs your district offers (dual language, ELD assessments, etc)?
# of teachers that would use these materials		
# of students that would use these materials		
		If the materials include designated ELD: Do materials support the required daily/weekly instructional minutes for the programs your district offers?
		How many minutes are provided per day/week?

Select which content area and type of instructional material you are reviewing to determine which rubrics to use.

Content Area <i>(check one)</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> ELA/ELD	<input type="checkbox"/> Math	<input type="checkbox"/> Science	<input type="checkbox"/> History Social Studies	<input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____
Type of Instructional Materials <i>(check one)</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Program 1: Basic ELA (Core) Use rubrics 1-5	<input type="checkbox"/> Core Program: Use rubrics 1-5	<input type="checkbox"/> Core Program: Use rubrics 1-5	<input type="checkbox"/> Core Program: Use rubrics 1-5	<input type="checkbox"/> Core Program: Use rubrics 1-5
	<input type="checkbox"/> Program 2: Basic ELA/ELD (Core) Use rubrics 1-6	<input type="checkbox"/> Supplemental Program Not applicable to this tool	<input type="checkbox"/> Supplemental Program Not applicable to this tool	<input type="checkbox"/> Supplemental Program Not applicable to this tool	<input type="checkbox"/> Supplemental Program Not applicable to this tool
	<input type="checkbox"/> Program 3: Basic Biliteracy (Core) Not applicable to this tool	<input type="checkbox"/> Intervention Program Not applicable to this tool	<input type="checkbox"/> Intervention Program Not applicable to this tool	<input type="checkbox"/> Intervention Program Not applicable to this tool	<input type="checkbox"/> Intervention Program Not applicable to this tool
	<input type="checkbox"/> Program 4: Intensive Intervention ELA (Intervention) Not applicable to this tool				
	<input type="checkbox"/> Program 5: Specialized ELD (Intervention) Not applicable to this tool				
<i>Publishers submit instructional materials for ELA/ELD under 1 of 5 programs for California's adoption list. If you're considering ELA/ELD, we recommend reading more about these programs to understand which meet the needs of your district.</i>					


Rubric 1: CA ELD Shifts

Use this rubric to determine how well materials leverage the ELD Shifts. The ELD Shifts describe the focus of the new ELD Standards and are applicable to all core materials you'll be reviewing as evidence of high quality materials for English Learners. Many of the descriptions below are technical and we recommend referencing the [ELD Framework](#) for more information.

Use for all core materials to assess for integrated EL supports.	Rubric 1: CA ELD Shifts			
Do the materials reflect...	<i>Check One</i>			Cite Evidence
	No Evidence	Some Evidence	Ample Evidence	
1.1 English as a meaning-making resource with different language choices based on discipline, topic, audience, task, and purpose? (Shift 1)				
1.2 An expanded notion of grammar as encompassing discourse, text structure, syntax, and vocabulary, and as inseparable from meaning? (Shift 2)				
1.3 Language acquisition as a nonlinear, spiraling, dynamic, and complex social process where meaningful interaction with others is essential? (Shift 3)				
1.4 Language development focused on interaction, collaboration, comprehension, and communication with strategic scaffolding to guide appropriate linguistic choices? (Shift 4)				
1.5 Complex texts and intellectually challenging activities focused on content knowledge building as critical and essential for learning academic English? (Shift 5)				
1.6 Alignment to content area standards? (We recommend leveraging the CDE adoption recommendations and our reviews for this step.)				
1.7 If an ELA/ELD program, alignment to CA ELD Standards?				


Rubric 2: Culture & Access

Use this rubric to determine how well materials leverage students' culture and language as well as how well materials provide access for students based on language proficiency and special needs.

Use for all core materials to assess for integrated EL supports.	Depth <i>(Check One)</i>			Frequency <i>(Check One)</i>		
How deeply and with what frequency do the materials...	Not present	Present but not specific to content	Embedded into material's design	Not present	In a few units	Every unit
2.1 Provide opportunities to incorporate students' cultural backgrounds, interests, and lived experiences in their learning that authentically reflect their experiences, cultures, and families?						
2.2 Value and build on primary language, culture, and other forms of prior knowledge?						
2.3 Access native language knowledge and cognates as vital linguistic resources?						
2.4 Provide access for English Learners to participate in grade-level, standards based curriculum?						
2.5 Build English Learners' content knowledge alongside their peers, setting them on a pathway to meeting the college- and career-ready standards?						
2.6 Foster progression through academic English language proficiency levels by scaffolding ELs access to content knowledge, including differentiated language objectives by proficiency level, sentence frames, and supports for participation?						
2.7 Provide explicit instruction in similarities and differences across primary language and English?						
2.8 Offer Universal Access materials that support the specific needs of English Learners?						
2.9 Offer Universal Access materials that enhance and extend differentiated instruction beyond what is in the teacher edition?						
Summary: Based on the information above, how would you rate the materials for Culture and Access:						


Rubric 3: Teacher Supports

Use this rubric to determine what level of supports the materials provide teachers to build capacity around implementing materials to best support English Learners.

Use for all core materials to assess for integrated EL supports.	Depth (Check One)			Frequency (Check One)		
How deeply and with what frequency do the materials ...	Not present	Present but not specific to content	Embedded into material's design	Not present	In a few units	Every unit
3.1 Provide educative resources for teachers to understand English Learner needs specific to the content being taught?						
3.2 Describe the English Learner theory and strategies for teachers in the introductory sections of materials?						
3.3 Implement research-based practices designed specifically for English Learners and the content being taught?						
3.4 Provide scaffolds based on formative assessment of student strengths and needs?						
3.4 Provide scaffolds designed to move from simple to rigorous language supports that fade out as students gain language proficiencies?						
3.5 Contain a clear road map for teachers to follow when planning instruction that supports effective CA CCSS and CA Next Generation Science Standards (NGSS) standards-based instruction?						
Summary: Based on the information above, how would you rate the materials for Teacher Supports:						

Rubric 4: Assessment

Use this rubric to understand how well assessments support understanding English Learners' proficiency and how to scaffold instruction to increase access to content.

Use for all core materials to assess for integrated EL supports.	Depth (Check One)			Frequency (Check One)		
How deeply and with what frequency do the materials ...	Not present	Present but not specific to content	Embedded into material's design	Not present	In a few units	Every unit
4.1 Monitor progress with California standards-aligned assessments and measure the effectiveness of instruction?						
4.2 Offer assessments that support planning instruction for English Learners?						
4.3 Offer assessments that determine grouping strategies for English Learners?						
4.4 Offer a variety of item types (selected/constructed response, 5.3 performance tasks, open-ended questions, technology embedded and technology enhanced, etc.) included in the assessment tools?						
4.5 Measure student progress toward mastery of the content of the standards with short-, medium-, and long-cycle assessment?						
4.6 Measure student progress toward mastery of the language proficiency of the standards with short-, medium-, and long-cycle assessment?						
4.7 Leverage short-cycle, formative assessment as the key driver in daily instructional decisions?						
4.8 Leverage medium-cycle, performance-based assessments to drive instruction?						
Summary: Based on the information above, how would you rate the materials for Assessment:						

Rubric 5: Student Supports

Use this rubric to determine how well materials support English Learners' access of and engagement with materials and instruction.

Use for all core materials to assess for integrated EL supports.	Depth (Check One)			Frequency (Check One)		
How deeply and with what frequency do the materials ...	Not present	Present but not specific to content	Embedded into material's design	Not present	In a few units	Every unit
5.1 Support oral language as the foundational support for engaging in all reading, writing, listening, speaking?						
5.2 Provide open-ended, higher level questions where students explain their thinking against grade level standards in multiple ways, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • collaborative (engagement in dialogue with others), • interpretive (comprehension and analysis of written and spoken texts), and • productive (creation of oral presentations and written texts)? 						
5.3 Offer differentiated scaffolding for ELs to access and express grade level content with language that demonstrates grade level rigor?						
5.4 Integrate collaborative writing, speaking, and listening objectives with language and content learning?						
5.5 Leverage instructional strategies that support ELs in engaging in authentic, collaborative conversations with peers based in grade level content and language?						
5.6 Include research and inquiry to develop knowledge (e.g., conceptual themes, essential questions, or short projects)?						
5.7 Provide language instruction (conventions of standard English, knowledge of language, and vocabulary) purposefully integrated in reading, writing, speaking & listening instruction?						

(Continues on next page)

Rubric 5: Student Supports

(Continued from previous page)

How deeply and with what frequency do the materials ...	Depth (Check One)			Frequency (Check One)		
	Not present	Present but not specific to content	Embedded into material's design	Not present	In a few units	Every unit
5.8 Explicitly teach writing that is connected to the reading and include opportunities for speaking, listening, and collaboration?						
5.9 Include embedded, integrated ELD instruction that allows students to interact and engage in collaborative, interpretive, and/or productive modes in meaningful ways?						
Summary: Based on the information above, how would you rate the materials for Student Supports:						

*Note for High School Student Supports: Additional criteria are needed for supporting ELs' disciplinary learning in high school (math, science, ELA, history, etc.). Students not only need to "explain" their thinking, but also have to demonstrate facilities in domain-specific practices in CCSS and NGSS. This includes argument from evidence (across all the disciplines), among other practices, as well as how knowledge is represented through semiotic modalities in each discipline.

Rubric 6: Designated ELD

Use this section to determine how well designated ELD materials support the needs of English Learners. These materials should be separate from core ELA materials and be designed as protected time to specifically support ELs . Read more about Designated ELD in the [CA ELA/ELD Framework](#).

Use for designated ELD materials to assess for alignment to ELD standards.	Depth (Check One)			Frequency (Check One)		
	Not present	Present but not specific to content	Embedded into material's design	Not present	In a few units	Every unit
How deeply and with what frequency do the materials ...						
6.1 Build bridges across core content and cite clear lesson objectives aligned with the CA ELD Standards and the appropriate content standards?						
6.2 Provide students with intellectually motivating, challenging, and purposeful tasks, along with the support to meet these tasks?						
6.3 Make students' proficiencies with academic English and literacy in the content area the main focus of instruction and strategically build those proficiencies?						
6.4 Create opportunities for students to communicate in meaningful ways using increasingly sophisticated English as they move along the ELD continuum?						
6.5 Focus on the language demands of ELA, Math, Science, and Social Studies, including the language of texts and tasks critical for understanding meaning?						
6.6 Focus on learning about how English works in the content/disciplinary areas based on purpose, audience, topic, and text type, with attention to discourse practices, text organization, grammatical structures, and vocabulary?						
6.7 Support teachers in contextualizing language instruction, building on background knowledge, and providing the appropriate level of scaffolding (both planned and just in time) based on individual differences and needs?						

(Continues on next page)

Section 6: Designated ELD *(Continued from previous page)*

How deeply and with what frequency do the materials ...	Depth (Check One)			Frequency (Check One)		
	Not present	Present but not specific to content	Embedded into material's design	Not present	In a few units	Every unit
6.8 Support teachers in monitoring student progress through informal observations and ongoing formative assessment practices to prioritize students' cultural and linguistic strengths and needs?						
Summary: Based on the information above, how would you rate the materials for Designated ELD:						

*Note for High School Student Supports: Additional criteria are needed for supporting ELs' disciplinary learning in high school (math, science, ELA, history, etc.). Students not only need to “explain” their thinking, but also have to demonstrate facilities in domain-specific practices in CCSS and NGSS. This includes argument from evidence (across all the disciplines), among other practices, as well as how knowledge is represented through semiotic modalities in each discipline.